United Nations S/PV.3470

Security Council
Forty-ninth Year

Provisional

3470th Meeting
Tuesday, 29 November 1994, 5.30 p.m.
New York

President:	Mrs. Albright	(United States of America)
Members:	Argentina	Mr. Cárdenas
	Brazil	Mr. Sardenberg
	China	Mr. Li Zhaoxing
	Czech Republic	Mr. Kovanda
	Djibouti	Mr. Olhaye
	France	Mr. Mérimée
	New Zealand	Mr. Keating
	Nigeria	Mr. Ayewah
	Oman	Mr. Al-Sameen
	Pakistan	Mr. Marker
	Russian Federation	Mr. Lavrov
	Rwanda	Mr. Bakuramutsa
	Spain	Mr. Yañez-Barnuevo
	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	Mr. Gomersall

Agenda

The question concerning Haiti

94-87270 (E)

This record contains the original text of speeches delivered in English and interpretations of speeches delivered in the other languages. The final text will be printed in the *Official Records of the Security Council*. Corrections should be submitted to original speeches only. They should be incorporated in a copy of the record and be sent under the signature of a member of the delegation concerned, *within one week of the date of publication*, to the Chief of the Verbatim Reporting Section, room C-178.

The meeting was called to order at 6.10 p.m.

Adoption of the agenda

The agenda was adopted.

The question concerning Haiti

The President: I should like to inform the Council that I have received letters from the representatives of Canada, Haiti and Venezuela in which they request to be invited to participate in the discussion of the item on the Council's agenda. In conformity with the usual practice, I propose, with the consent of the Council, to invite those representatives to participate in the discussion, without the right to vote, in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Charter and rule 37 of the Council's provisional rules of procedure.

There being no objection, it is so decided.

At the invitation of the President, Mr. Longchamp (Haiti) took a place at the Council table; Mr. Karsgaard (Canada) and Mr. Tejera Paris (Venezuela) took the places reserved for them at the side of the Council table.

The President: The Security Council will now begin its consideration of the item on its agenda.

The Security Council is meeting in accordance with the understanding reached in its prior consultations.

Members of the Council have before them the report of the Secretary-General on the question concerning Haiti, document S/1994/1180, and the report of the Secretary-General on the implementation of resolution 940 (1994), document S/1994/1322.

Members of the Council also have before them document S/1994/1354, which contains the text of a draft resolution submitted by Argentina, Canada, France, the United States of America and Venezuela.

I should like to draw the attention of the members of the Council to the following revision to be made to the text of the draft resolution contained in document S/1994/1354 in its provisional form. Operative paragraph 3 should read as follows:

> "*Pays tribute* to President Jean-Bertrand Aristide for his efforts to promote national reconciliation;".

I should like to draw the attention of the members of the Council to the following other documents: S/1994/1107, S/1994/1148, S/1994/1208, S/1994/1258 and S/1994/1321, letters dated 27 September, 10 and 24 October and 7 and 21 November 1994, respectively, from the Permanent Representative of the United States of America to the United Nations addressed to the President of the Security Council, transmitting the reports of the Multinational Force in Haiti.

It is my understanding that the Council is ready to proceed to vote on the draft resolution before it, as orally revised in its provisional form. Unless I hear any objection, I shall put the draft resolution to the vote.

There being no objection, it is so decided.

I shall first call on those members of the Council who wish to make statements before the voting.

Mr. Sardenberg (Brazil): The restoration of constitutional rule in Haiti constituted the achievement of a long-awaited goal of the international community. Brazil has joined in the celebration of the courageous Haitian people, while rejecting the de facto authorities, in hailing the return to power of the legitimately elected President Jean-Bertrand Aristide. We have thus strongly welcomed the positive evolution of the political situation in Haiti, in particular the efforts undertaken by President Aristide to promote a process of national reconciliation through dialogue involving all sectors of Haitian society.

The Security Council has been seized of the question concerning Haiti since the adoption of resolution 841 (1993) and has been called upon to take actions commensurate with the complexity and uniqueness of the circumstances prevailing therein. In the course of the many deliberations held in the Council, Brazil has always advocated the position that, in all cases, diplomatic and other political resources should be exhausted before coercive measures are adopted. In particular, my delegation has more than once expressed its reservations on actions not undertaken under the direct control of the United Nations.

Since the Security Council considered the options available to establish an expanded force of the United Nations Mission in Haiti (UNMIH), Brazil has upheld the view that a United Nations presence in Haiti would warrant a strengthening of UNMIH in order fully to implement the mandate emanating from resolution 867 (1993), in accordance with established principles and

practices of United Nations operations. As a result, the objective of expanding the Advance Team of UNMIH would seem to be a justifiable development in the light of the situation in Haiti.

While concurring with the objective of advancing the process of future deployment of the United Nations Mission in Haiti (UNMIH) as soon as the security situation in Haiti permits, my delegation expresses concern at the terms under which this measure is being taken by the Council.

While we could have supported an objective, procedural resolution expanding the advance team of UNMIH, without entering into considerations of a political nature, the draft resolution before us still contains elements over which my delegation has expressed reservations on all prior occasions. Since we cannot allow for a retroactive endorsement of provisions authorizing recourse to all necessary means in our region, our concerns remain unchanged. Therefore, Brazil will abstain in the vote.

With the restoration of President Jean-Bertrand Aristide to power, the international community should now assist the Government of Haiti in the challenging tasks of the socio-economic rehabilitation of a country devastated by a military junta, which had no commitment to the well-being of the Haitian people. Brazil stands ready to participate actively in these efforts.

Mr. Lavrov (Russian Federation) (*interpretation from Russian*): The Russian delegation is also interested in a swift stabilization of the situation in Haiti as the country shifts into a normal way of life. At the same time, we continue to have serious doubts as to the advisability and timeliness of the adoption of this draft resolution authorizing a significant increase in the numbers of the advance team of the United Nations Mission in Haiti (UNMIH).

As we have had occasion to state on many occasions in the course of earlier consultations of the Security Council, the adoption of this draft resolution could mean that there is a kind of creeping, de facto transition from the Multinational Force in Haiti (MNF) mission towards a United Nations stage of the operation when the requirements laid down in Security Council resolution 940 (1994) have basically not been met or implemented and when the Security Council has not yet taken the appropriate decision.

This was confirmed in the oral report to the Security Council by the Special Representative of the United Nations Secretary-General, Ambassador Brahimi, who clearly stated that what is involved is an increase in the operation from 60 to 6,000 persons. We see a direct contradiction here with the assurances given by the sponsors of resolution 940 (1994) on its adoption that there would be no automatic shift from an MNF operation to a United Nations operation.

Resolution 940 (1994) sets forth the maximum numbers for the advance team and clearly describes what its mandate is. There is an assessment of the requirements and preparations for the deployment of the United Nations Mission in Haiti following the conclusion of the MNF mission.

As paragraph 11 of the Secretary-General's report (S/1994/1322) notes, the advance team is carrying out the tasks entrusted to it, having successfully assessed the requirements for equipment and personnel for the United Nations mission. Unfortunately, we have not yet been able to see the report on this question. Moreover, the Secretary-General gave instructions to send to Haiti a technical team of administrative and logistic specialists, and we do not yet have any idea what assessment that team has made.

Under those circumstances, it is difficult for us to get a clear picture of what an advance team of 500 persons is going to be doing, even while its numbers are gradually being increased. The draft resolution as originally submitted also gave a very vague idea of the mandate of the group, and we were unable to glean any clear notion of the composition of the additional contingent that is to be sent to beef up the advance team.

We note that the sponsors did try to take account of our concerns, and to some extent the text of the draft resolution has been amended in respect of the mechanics of expanding the advance team and ensuring transparency, as well as in respect of clarifying and spelling out the mandate. Unfortunately, those amendments have not fully answered our questions.

We cannot fail to note for the nth time that there is a clear disproportion in the amount of attention given and reaction evidenced by the Security Council to one specific situation, even under conditions when the requirements set by the Council have certainly not been implemented and met, and, at the same time, in other circumstances the adoption of decisions relating to very acute situations

that actually pose a threat to international peace and security is dragged out. In our opinion, we are once again faced with a demonstration of double standards, which is simply intolerable in the activities of the Council, and this point was made by the Russian Foreign Minister, Mr. Andrei Kozyrev, in his statement here on 17 October.

In light of what I have said, the Russian delegation will not be able to support the draft resolution and will abstain in the vote on it. We will, however, try to ensure full implementation of the demands made by the Security Council before consideration of the matter of a possible shift towards the second, United Nations, stage of the operation, as stipulated in paragraph 8 of resolution 940 (1994).

In conclusion, I would emphasize once again that our position does not in any way detract from Russia's true interest in ensuring a swift stabilization of the situation in Haiti. Our position is dictated exclusively by our desire to ensure respect for what has been established by way of standards and procedures in the Security Council.

The President: We shall now proceed to vote on the draft resolution contained in document S/1994/1354, as orally revised in its provisional form.

A vote was taken by show of hands.

In favour: Argentina, China, Czech Republic, Djibouti, France, New Zealand, Nigeria, Oman, Pakistan, Rwanda, Spain, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America

Against: None

Abstaining: Brazil, Russian Federation

The President: The result of the voting is as follows: 13 votes in favour, none against and 2 abstentions. The draft resolution, as orally revised in its provisional form, has been adopted as resolution 964 (1994).

I shall now call on those members of the Council who wish to make statements following the voting.

Mr. Mérimée (France) (*interpretation from French*): Since the intervention of the Multinational Force in Haiti in peaceful conditions, which we sincerely welcome, the situation in Haiti has steadily improved. As stipulated in the Governors Island Agreement, President Aristide has returned to his country. He has initiated a genuine policy of national reconciliation and has designated a Prime Minister appreciated by all sectors of Haitian society. Mr. Smark Michel, in turn, has formed an open Government determined to implement a pragmatic programme to rebuild the country's institutions and economy. Human rights today are better respected. Violence, a daily occurrence prior to the intervention, has declined considerably, and while, owing to the persistent unrest, it is too early to see the establishment of a safe and stable environment in the provinces where the Multinational Force is not present, it cannot be denied that significant progress has been made in that direction. I should like once again to pay a tribute to the leaders and participants of the Multinational Force.

In this favourable context, my delegation believes that thought should be given, here and now, to the transition period and to the replacement of the multinational force by the United Nations Mission in Haiti (UNMIH). Because of its concern that this should be prepared for in the best possible conditions my delegation voted in favour of the resolution, by which it is decided to strengthen the advance team of UNMIH. Special emphasis should be placed on the training of the police and on the preparations for free and regular legislative elections.

My delegation wishes to recall the importance that we attach to this point in time, which is a crucial moment in the political life of Haiti and in the restoration of democracy. The United Nations should step up its preparations for the holding of this poll, and the Haitian Government should undertake without delay the measures that are within its competence. France is prepared to provide assistance with the arrangements for the elections.

France is participating in UNMIH through the provision of police and gendarmes. A contingent is already in place. France is prepared to make its contribution to the rebirth of this country. In addition to the usual economic and technical assistance, it is willing to help to rebuild its institutions and its legal system — prerequisites for the establishment of a state of law and political stability. A comprehensive programme of cooperation has been undertaken, and missions are visiting Haiti for this purpose with a view to supporting the efforts of the Government and of the international community.

Mr. Li Zhaoxing (China) *(interpretation from Chinese):* The Governors Island Agreement has been implemented with some success since President Aristide's

return to Haiti on 15 October 1994. The political situation in Haiti is moving towards stability. The security situation is improving, and people's lives are returning to normal.

Progress in the Haitian political settlement is inextricably linked to Security Council support. We therefore support the Secretary-General's proposal that the advance team of the United Nations Mission in Haiti (UNMIH) be gradually expanded to prepare and plan for the further role of the United Nations in the peace process. On the basis of its consistent support for the efforts of the Haitian people to achieve lasting peace, the Chinese delegation voted in favour of Security Council resolution 964 (1994), which has just been adopted.

The Chinese delegation wishes to put on record its reservations with regard to elements of resolution 964 (1994) concerning the multinational force. This force may have contributed to the establishment of a secure environment in Haiti. Our reservations are based on China's principled position concerning the peaceful settlement of disputes.

China has consistently complied with the purposes and principles of the United Nations Charter and opposed interference in the internal affairs of other countries and the use or threat of the use of force in international relations. We expounded this position when the Council adopted resolution 940 (1994), which authorized military action in Haiti. Still less should resolution 964 (1994), which has just been adopted, be understood as an affirmation of this so-called formula.

As always, China will support the Secretary-General and his Special Representative, the Organization of American States and Latin American countries in their unremitting efforts to accelerate Haiti's peace process and restore its economy. We wish the Haitian people further progress in their continued efforts to overcome difficulties on the road to stability, peace and national reconstruction.

Mr. Cardenas (Argentina) *(interpretation from Spanish)*: My country, acting in its capacity as a member of the Group of Friends of the Secretary-General for Haiti, was one of the sponsors of the resolution that has just been adopted. The basic purpose of this initiative is fully justified in the commendable report of the Secretary-General, in the extensive and timely explanations provided by his Special Representative for Haiti, Mr. Brahimi, to whom we express our full support, and, of course, in the terms of resolution 940 (1994) and the earlier resolutions.

We hope that the gradual and progressive strengthening of the advance team of the United Nations Mission in Haiti (UNMIH) will help to provide a safe and stable environment in the country, thus speeding up the orderly and proper transition from the multinational force to the United Nations operation.

The positive development of the situation in Haiti will continue to require the Council's active involvement. This is the basic point underlying Argentina's position, and it is the basis of the commitment that guided us in our decision to make available personnel and other resources for the two phases provided for in resolution 940 (1994).

Therefore, given the favourable trend of events in Haiti, the Argentine Republic continues to be optimistic that the efforts of this Organization will benefit the people of the country, who are the true depository of Haitian sovereignty.

We wish to thank all those — especially the many countries of the region — who, within the framework of the United Nations Charter, by participating in the multinational force or in the United Nations teams, are working together to secure the peaceful restoration of democracy in Haiti and the reconciliation of its people.

The President: I shall now make a statement in my capacity as the representative of the United States.

The United States is pleased to support this resolution endorsing the Secretary-General's recommendation to expand the advance team of the United Nations Mission in Haiti (UNMIH). The resolution marks another step on the road to the full restoration of democracy in Haiti. This expansion will ease the transition from the multinational force in Haiti (MNF) to UNMIH and will help to ensure the success of both operations. As a friend of the Secretary-General for Haiti, my Government thanks the French delegation for its foresight in introducing the resolution.

To date, this operation has been a great success. In the two months and 10 days since the MNF deployed to Haiti, and in the six weeks since President Aristide returned to Haiti, we have witnessed a transformation in that country. Where once there was a dictatorship run through fear and oppression, now there are the beginnings of true democracy and hope for the people of Haiti. This Council should take heart from the fact that so much has been done in so short a time.

We note here the Secretary-General's observation that no acts of intimidation or violence against the United Nations or any other international presence have been reported. The operation in Haiti is poised to become a model for peace-keeping and international cooperation. In this regard, we support the work of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General, Mr. Brahimi, as he fulfils his duties and carries forward the project.

The resolution rightly commends the efforts of the MNF to establish a secure and stable environment in Haiti, while paying special tribute to President Aristide for his efforts to foster national reconciliation. The MNF and the international community are doing an outstanding job with Haitian restoration.

I was fortunate enough to be able to visit Haiti last week, and I can verify the progress cited in MNF reports and in those that I have given this Council. I met with President Aristide, Prime Minister Michel, members of the Cabinet and the political opposition. I visited with MNF troops and observed the training of the interim police force. Democracy is taking root in Haiti. Institutions are being rebuilt, and tough political issues are being debated in a democratic process — not settled through violence and intimidation.

Much remains to be done. However, we are on the right track, and this resolution keeps up the momentum. As the Secretary-General notes in his report, the UNMIH advance team is working closely with the MNF to prepare for the transition to UNMIH under the provisions of resolution 940 (1994). Expanding the size of the advance team will provide the planning flexibility necessary for that transition.

In asking that the Secretary-General inform the Council of increases and that these increases be coordinated with the MNF Commander, the resolution underscores the good planning and coordination that already characterize this operation. On the basis of progress to date, the benefits of such coordination speak for themselves.

Increasing the size of the UNMIH advance team in the careful fashion called for in this resolution makes a key contribution to this transition. It is the task of the MNF to establish a secure and stable environment so that the next phase — a political, economic and social rebuilding under the eye of UNMIH — can occur. The ultimate beneficiaries will not only be the United Nations and participating Member States but will be, most importantly, the people of Haiti.

I resume my function as President of the Council.

There are no further speakers on my list. The Security Council has thus concluded the present stage of its consideration of the item on the agenda.

The meeting rose at 6.40 p.m.